The need for mass balance and feedback in the geochemical carbon cycle

Robert A. Berner and Ken Caldeira

Geology 1997;25:955-956

Copyright not claimed on content prepared wholly by U.S. government employees within scope of their employment. Individual scientists are hereby granted permission, without fees or further requests to GSA, to use a single figure, a single table, and/or a brief paragraph of text in subsequent works and to make unlimited copies of items in GSA's journals for noncommercial use in classrooms to further education and science. This file may not be posted to any Web site, but authors may post the abstracts only of their articles on their own or their organization's Web site providing the posting includes a reference to the article's full citation. GSA provides this and other forums for the presentation of diverse opinions and positions by scientists worldwide, regardless of their race, citizenship, gender, religion, or political viewpoint. Opinions presented in this publication do not reflect official positions of the Society.
The need for mass balance and feedback in the geochemical carbon cycle

Robert A. Berner
Department of Geology and Geophysics, Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut 06520-8109

Ken Caldeira
Climate System Modeling Group, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, 7000 East Ave, L-256 Livermore, California 94550

INTRODUCTION

On a multimillion-year time scale, the level of atmospheric carbon dioxide, and consequently the atmospheric greenhouse effect, is affected largely by the geochemical, or long-term, carbon cycle. This cycle (for a review, see Holland, 1978; Berner, 1991) involves the exchange of carbon dioxide between rocks, on the one hand, and the surficial reservoir, consisting of the combined atmosphere, oceans, biosphere, plus soils, on the other. Carbon dioxide is exchanged with the surficial system via weathering of silicates and organic matter on the continents, the burial of carbonates (derived from silicate weathering) and organic matter in sediments, and the thermal breakdown of carbonates and organic matter at depth.

It has been suggested (Edmond et al., 1995; see also Edmond and Huh, 1997; Bickle, 1996) that in the geochemical carbon cycle there is no necessity for a close balance between atmospheric inputs and outputs of CO₂, and therefore no need for a strongly coupled feedback to stabilize CO₂ level in the atmosphere. On the basis of their study of the chemistry of major rivers, Edmond et al. (1995) concluded that climate has little effect on global weathering rate and criticized the idea that long-term stabilization of CO₂ and climate comes about by increased chemical weathering rate that accompanies global greenhouse warming. In place of a climate-weathering feedback, Edmond et al. (1995) and Bickle (1996) assumed that increases in global degassing are eventually matched by increases in CO₂ uptake via enhanced weathering accompanying mountain uplift. We show here that in this case, atmospheric CO₂ would vary untenably as a result of large imbalances in the carbon cycle.

CARBON MASS BALANCE

The combined surficial-atmosphere-ocean-biosphere-soil reservoir (about 3 x 10¹⁸ mol C) is small compared to that of the rock reservoir (about 5000 x 10¹⁸ mol carbonate C plus 1300 x 10¹⁸ mol of organic C; Berner et al., 1983). Appreciable carbon cannot be stored in the surficial system. The atmosphere cannot have stored too much CO₂, or greenhouse warming would have become excessive in the past and higher life would have perished. The oceans cannot have stored large amounts of dissolved carbon because (1) the existence of marine limestones over geologic time precludes the storage of high concentrations of dissolved CO₂, and therefore high acidity, in seawater, and (2) accumulation of high concentrations of dissolved HCO₃ in the oceans, derived from continental weathering, would lead to supersaturation with carbonate minerals and the removal of the carbon to the sediments via precipitation, with or without biological mediation. The biosphere is limited in size by the carrying capacity of the land and sea.

Integrated over millions of years, the fluxes of CO₂ via degassing and silicate weathering, along with organic matter weathering and burial, are very large compared to the mass of carbon at the surface of the Earth. If appreciable carbon cannot be stored in the surficial system, there must be a close balance over millions of years between the total input and output fluxes from the rock reservoirs (Holland, 1978). Simple calculations show that this balance must be very close; the consequences of a 25% imbalance on atmospheric CO₂ is shown in Figure 1. This calculation assumes: (1) the approximate present-day uptake of CO₂ by Ca and Mg silicate weathering is about 8 x 10¹⁸ mol C per million years; (2) CO₂ gas solubility equilibrium and sediment calcium carbonate dissolution and/or precipitation to equilibrium are maintained in a simple one box ocean; (3) there is no other operative feedback mechanism to remove excess CO₂; and (4) the organic carbon subcycle is balanced for the purposes of discussion. As shown by the figure, if degassing were to differ from weathering by only 25%, after millions of years levels of CO₂ would become excessively high or low, inimitable to life, and far out of line with estimates of paleo-CO₂ over Phanerozoic time using a variety of techniques (for a recent compilation, see Berner, 1997). These calculations indicate that any appreciable imbalance between CO₂ input to and outputs from the surficial system over millions of years (e.g., Edmond et al., 1995; Bickle, 1996) is untenable.

NEGATIVE FEEDBACK

In order to maintain a close balance between atmospheric CO₂ inputs and outputs, it is necessary that some sort of rapidly acting restorative mechanism be operative. Somehow, a rise in atmospheric CO₂ must put into play a counteractive process or processes that would work against this rise. A number of mechanisms could accomplish the countereffect, but true negative feedback processes must functionally depend on the level of atmospheric CO₂. Processes independent of atmospheric CO₂ would not be expected to prevent excessive fluctuations in atmospheric CO₂. For example, an increase in volcanic degassing would not be expected to be perfectly balanced, to a sufficient degree and within a sufficiently short period, by enhanced weathering due to mountain uplift to prevent excessive variations in CO₂.

The most commonly accepted process for providing rapid negative feedback, which also exhibits explicit functional dependence on atmospheric CO₂, is the response of silicate weathering to changes in climate (e.g., Walker et al., 1981; Berner et al., 1983). The key to this feedback is the atmospheric greenhouse effect. Simply stated, the idea is that high global temperatures and especially greater rainfall on continents, caused by higher CO₂, should bring about enhanced CO₂ removal via faster silicate weathering.

Figure 1. Effect on atmospheric CO₂ of 25% imbalance in CO₂ degassing and silicate-rock weathering starting from two initial atmospheric CO₂ contents (280 µatm and 2800 µatm), assuming balanced organic carbon subcycle. Excess in CO₂ degassing of 25% would increase atmospheric CO₂ beyond reasonable Phanerozoic bounds within 10 m.y., and 25% excess in silicate-rock weathering would deplete nearly all atmospheric CO₂ within a few million years. Excess of 2.5% would have same effect in 10 times as much time. This indicates that total CO₂ inputs and output to and from the atmosphere have been closely balanced throughout Phanerozoic.

GEOLOGY, October 1997
Atmospheric general circulation models indicate that enhanced atmospheric CO$_2$ content leads to warmer temperatures, increased precipitation, and increased runoff (e.g., Manabe and Stouffer, 1993). Studies of silicate weathering where other factors such as lithology are held constant (e.g., White and Blum, 1995) show that warmer temperatures, greater precipitation, and greater runoff lead to increased silicate rock weathering. Chemical calculations show that enhanced silicate rock weathering leads to diminished atmospheric CO$_2$ content. Together, these relations produce a negative feedback that stabilizes atmospheric CO$_2$. With this feedback, possibly combined with others, atmospheric CO$_2$ content adjusts until a climate is produced in which CO$_2$ consumed in silicate weathering and organic matter burial balances the CO$_2$ supplied from organic matter weathering plus degassing from volcanism, metamorphism, and diageneisis.

Edmond et al. (1995) stated that nonclimatic factors, principally relief, but also lithology, explain most of the observed variance in chemical weathering between river basins. This contrasts with many other studies (e.g., Jenny, 1941; Loughnan, 1969; White and Blum, 1995; Amiotte Suchet and Probst, 1995; see also Berner and Berner, 1997) that show that climate, especially rainfall, is important in silicate weathering. Even if Edmond et al. (1995) are correct, it would be erroneous to conclude that any particular river basin of constant relief and lithology (or the continents as a whole) would not undergo increased weathering as a result of greater rainfall and higher temperatures due to global greenhouse warming.

Factors that enhance the ease by which silicate rocks are weathered (“weatherability”), such as mountain uplift or the evolution of land plants, might cool climate but do not simply bring about change in the long-term global silicate rock weathering rate. In this case, CO$_2$ would be removed from the atmosphere until the global reduction in weathering, due to a cooler and drier climate, was balanced by the increase in weathering due to increased weatherability. The time to reach the new steady state should be less than a million years (Sundquist, 1991). Thus, on a million-year time scale, chemical weathering rates are controlled by the rate of CO$_2$ supply to the surficial system.

CONCLUSIONS

1. Inputs and outputs of carbon to and from the surficial system, consisting of the oceans, atmosphere, soils, and biosphere, are closely balanced over million-year time scales.

2. A negative feedback that is functionally related to atmospheric CO$_2$ content is required to maintain this close balance.

3. The response of silicate weathering to changes in climate is sufficient to provide this negative feedback.

4. Long-term global weathering rates are controlled by the rate of CO$_2$ supply to the surficial system (and imbalances in the organic carbon cycle).

REFERENCES CITED


